

July 18, 2018

Mark Lyons, Senior Manager  
RES America Developments, Inc.  
11101 West 120<sup>th</sup> Avenue, Suite 400  
Broomfield, Colorado 80021

**Re: *Ball Hill Wind Energy Project***  
***Towns of Hanover and Villenova, Chautauqua County, New York***

Dear Mr. Lyons:

Pursuant to your request, I have reviewed the Ball Hill Wind Project Visual Resource Assessment – Technical Memorandum prepared by Saratoga Associates dated February 2018 specific to changes on the above captioned project.

### **Project Description:**

The Ball Hill Wind Energy Project is an approximately 100 megawatt wind energy project proposed for an area located within two towns in the northeastern portion of Chautauqua County, New York. The proposed project will consist of a total of 29 turbines located on approximately 5,569 acres (includes all easements and setbacks necessary for project construction). The turbines are proposed to be located in the Town of Hanover and the Town of Villenova.

Residential uses are either clustered at various crossroad hamlets or are very sparsely located on individual parcels. Residences are often located roadside, however many are located on isolated lots not viewable from local roads. These rural homes range in quality and condition from well-maintained single-family frame construction to older homes exhibiting significant signs of deferred maintenance. There are also a number of seasonal homes, camps and cabins interspersed throughout the market area. New residential development is limited in the market area.

### **Project Changes:**

The primary changes to the project consists of changes to the turbine height which resulted in an increase of 60 feet in hub height, 32 feet to the rotor diameter and 76 feet in maximum blade tip height. Based on the technical memorandum, the Zone of Visual Influence (five-mile radius) for the 2016 layout versus the proposed 2017 layout is minimal.

Other changes include the elimination of a 5.8 mile above ground transmission line and 60 tangent and angled structures that will significantly reduce visibility of the project. It is noted in the memorandum the proposed revisions will slightly increase the total acreage that may have visibility of the project.

**Conclusion:**

Based on a review of the cited technical memorandum prepared by Saratoga Associates, there is no conclusive evidence which would indicate any additional impact or potential impact on residential real estate values in the market area analyzed due to the proposed project changes from my 2106 report.

This conclusion is in concert with much of the quantitative research available today on wind farm development effects on property value. While it is impossible to definitively say that there will be no effect on every affected properties value, it is apparent from studying similar areas where wind farms have been developed that no broad based value effects have occurred in those markets.

Respectfully submitted,

**IREM Solutions, Inc.**

*Darrel R. Lloyd Jr.*

Darrel R. Lloyd Jr.  
New York State Certified General  
Real Estate Appraiser  
Certificate #46-5539

**Addenda**

**Qualifications of Darrel R. Lloyd, Jr.**

## QUALIFICATIONS OF DARREL R. LLOYD, JR.

---

**IREM Solutions, Inc.**

### **Education:**

- Valencia College, Orlando, Florida
- State University of New York at Buffalo

### **Technical Training:**

- Society of Real Estate Appraisers-Course 101, "Introduction to Appraising Real Property", Buffalo, New York, 1989
- Society of Real Estate Appraisers-Course 102, "Applied Residential Property Valuation", Buffalo, New York, 1987
- Society of Real Estate Appraisers-Course 201, "Principles of Income Property Appraising", Buffalo, New York, 1988
- Society of Real Estate Appraisers-Course 202, "Applied Income Property Valuation", Tarpon Springs, Florida, 1989
- Society of Real Estate Appraisers, "Professional Practice Seminar", Kingston, NY, 1989
- Marshall & Swift Cost Valuation Seminar, "Calculator Cost Method", Buffalo, NY, 1988
- Appraisal Institute, "Standards of Professional Practice", Buffalo, New York, 1991
- Appraisal Institute - Course 520, "Highest & Best Use and Market Analysis", West Palm Beach, Florida, 1994
- American Society Appraisers, "Machinery and Technical Specialties", Chicago, IL, 1994
- American Society Appraisers, "Business Valuation", Toronto, Canada, 1994
- National Golf Foundation, "Golf Course Development and Revaluation", San Francisco, California, 1995
- Appraisal Institute, "Appraisal of Nursing Facilities", Syracuse, New York, 1997
- Appraisal Institute, "Standards of Professional Practice", Buffalo, New York, 1996
- Appraisal Institute, "Standards of Professional Practice", Boca Rotan, Florida, 12/2002
- Appraisal Institute, "Evaluating Commercial Construction", Tampa, Florida, 11/2003
- Appraisal Institute, "National USPAP Course", Amherst, New York, 05/2006
- Appraisal Institute, "Analyzing Operating Expenses", 11/2007
- Seminar: "Law of Easements", Buffalo, New York, 06/2008
- Appraisal Institute, "Valuation Case Studies", Ellicottville, New York, 01/2009
- Appraisal Institute, "Valuation Case Studies", Tampa, Florida,
- Appraisal Institute, "Office Building Valuation", Tampa, Florida, 10/2010
- Appraisal Institute, "Business Practice & Ethics", 10/2010
- Appraisal Institute, "Analyzing Tenant Credit Risk/Commercial Lease Analysis", Lakewood Ranch, FL, 09/2011
- Appraisal Institute, "National USPAP Course", 07/2011
- Appraisal Institute, "Valuation Perspectives Course", Ellicottville, New York 02/2012
- Appraisal Institute, "Fundamentals of Separating Real Property, Personal Property and Intangible Business Assets Course", Lakewood Ranch, FL,03/2012
- Pennsylvania Law for Appraisers, 5/2013
- 2014-2015 "National USPAP Course", 11/2013
- Appraisal of fast food facilities, 4/2015
- Expert witness for commercial appraisers, 6/2015
- Appraisal of self-storage facilities, 11/2015

**Technical Training (Contd):**

- 2016-2017 – “National USPAP Course”, 5/22/2017
- Appraisal of Single Tenant Distribution Centers, 5/22/17
- Residential Appraisal Review and USPAP Compliance, 5/26/2017
- The Dirty Dozen, 9/11/2017
- Managing Appraiser Liability, 9/18/2017
- PA State Mandated Law For Appraisers, 5/15/2017

**Appraisal Assignments:**

- Apartment Complexes
- Automobile Dealerships
- Bulk Petroleum Storage Terminals
- Certiorari Actions
- Community Shopping Plazas
- Condemnation Properties
- Feasibility Studies
- Funeral Homes
- Gas and Service Stations
- Golf Courses
- High Rise Condominiums & Office Bldgs.
- Hotels
- Industrial Complexes
- Land Fills
- Banks,
- Steel Plants,
- Medical Offices
- Nursing Homes
- ROW Projects
- Rehabilitation
- Restaurants
- Retail Department Stores
- Residential
- Steel Plants
- Special Purpose Properties
- Pipelines, Tank Farms
- Petroleum Bulk Storage Facilities
- Temporary and Permanent Easements
- Urban Renewal
- Vacant Land and Subdivision Analysis
- Waterfront Properties
- Nascar Raceway

**Prepared & Participated in Appraisals For:**

- AT&T Financial Services
- Affiliated Capital Corporation
- Bank of New York
- Benchmark Financial, Inc.
- Buffalo Urban Renewal Agency
- Central Trust Company
- Citibank (NYS) N.A.
- Citizen Associates, Ltd.
- Diversified Capital
- Empire of America, FSA
- Erie Cnty. Industrial Development Agency
- Fleet Bank, N.A
- Future Funding Mortgage Co., of NY, Inc.
- ITT Small Business Finance Corporation
- Key Bank of New York
- Liberty Mutual
- First Niagara Bank
- Manufacturers & Traders Trust Company
- HSBC Bank
- Midas Realty Corporation
- Niagara Frontier Transportation Authority
- NYS Housing Finance Agency
- NYS DOT
- Sibley Mortgage Corporation
- Statewide Capital Corp.
- The Chase Manhattan Bank
- Various Municipalities
- UAW Legal Services

- KPMG Peat Marwick
- Various attorneys & private clients
- Sprague Energy

**Darrel R. Lloyd, Jr. (Cont'd.)**

**Page 3**

**IREM Solutions, Inc.**

**Licensure/Certifications:**

- New York State Certified General Real Estate Appraiser #46-5539
- Pennsylvania State Certified General Real Estate Appraiser #GA003387
- Florida State Certified General Real Estate Appraiser #RZ3955
- New York State Appraisal Continuing Education Instructor
- Maine State Temporary License Certificate #TL3798

**Prepared Appraisals in:**

California, Colorado, Connecticut, Delaware, Florida, Kansas, Indiana, Georgia, Maine, Massachusetts, Missouri, New Hampshire, New York (including New York City), Ohio, Oklahoma, Pennsylvania, Rhode Island, Texas, Vermont.

**Qualified As Expert Witness:**

- The appraiser has appeared as an expert witness regarding real estate valuation in New York State Supreme and Federal Courts.
- The appraiser has also appeared before municipal assessment review boards.

**Employment History:**

- IREM Solutions, Inc., Amherst, NY, CEO, 2012-Present
- Klauk, Lloyd & Wilhelm Inc., Buffalo, NY, Vice President/Partner, 1995-2012
- Upstate Appraisal, Inc. - Commercial, Buffalo, NY, Vice President/Manager, 1993-1995
- International Appraisal Associates (Commercial, Industrial, and Residential), Tonawanda, NY, President, 1990-1993
- Northeastern Appraisal Associates - Commercial Division, Amherst, NY, Associate Appraiser, 1986-1989
- Century 21 M.J. Peterson, Sales Associate, 1982-1986